APPENDIX D

Common Metrics and Accountability Measures

Applicable to Requests for Applications of
the Division of Workforce and Economic Development

Background

In 2004, Assembly Bill 1417 triggered the creation of a performance measurement system for the California Community Colleges. That legislation and ensuing budget action authorized the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) to design and implement a performance measurement system containing performance indicators for the system and its colleges. This comprehensive system is known as the Accountability Reporting for the Community Colleges, or ARCC.

In 2012, the Student Success Task Force (SSTF) formed by Senate Bill 1143 recommended the implementation of a new accountability framework to provide stakeholders with clear and concise information on key student progress and success metrics in order to improve performance. The recommendation emphasized that a scorecard be built on the existing ARCC reporting system.

Following adoption of the SSTF recommendations, the ARCC (2.0) Advisory Workgroup, which guided the development of the initial accountability system in 2005, was reconvened. The workgroup had representation by individuals from various community college organizations and stakeholder groups, as well as researchers with technical expertise in performance measures. This technical workgroup reviewed the existing framework and designed the new scorecard to be released across the system in 2013.

ARCC 2.0 Framework

The ARCC Advisory Workgroup recommends a four-tiered accountability framework, where each level targets a different audience or user.

- The first level provides a report of the state of the system, a high level overview for legislators and policy makers that summarizes a number of state level aggregations of data and annual performance.

- The scorecard itself is the second level and measures progress and completion at each college for various groups of student demographics, including those with different levels of college preparation. This will be the core of the framework and part of the report that focuses on the performance of each college and incorporates many of the recommendations from the SSTF, such as providing metrics pertaining to momentum points, the disaggregation of metrics by racial and ethnic groups and the inclusion of students taking less than 12 units.

- The third level is the ability to drill down further into the scorecard metrics through the existing online query tool, Datamart 2.0 and for CTE, the addition of the LaunchBoard.

- The fourth and most detailed level is the ability for researchers to download the datasets (Data-on-Demand) pertaining to each metric for their particular college.

The details of the above accountability framework can be viewed at the following URL: http://extranet.cccco.edu/Portals/1/ExecutiveOffice/Board/2012_agenda/november/4_4_scorecard.pdf

Measures

The accountability for and measurement of grant activities administered through CCCCO's Workforce and Economic Development Division is based on the above ARCC 2.0 framework and augments that work because scope of the Division's grants span from middle schools through community college as well as post community college and into the workforce. Three categories of measures have been included:

- *Quality of service (applies to key talent roles)*
- *Leading indicators of curriculum alignment to labor market needs*
- *Student momentum points*

Depending on the performance requirements of the funding stream from which the grant originated, certain measures within these three categories will become more relevant, but the overriding objective of moving the needle on student outcomes remains, rather than the prior practice of monitoring activities and outputs.

With this unified framework of common metrics and accountability measures, funding and program decisions can be more data-driven and evidence-based given what works in moving students towards success.

Quality of Service Measures

Certain grants are designated as 'key talents' grants for the system. Key talents facilitate and promote collaboration within a region, a sector, and/or their key constituents. These activities lead to quality of services as measured by:

QS 0. 360-degree evaluation
The tool will be provided by the CCCCO. Parties surveyed will give consideration to the individual's performance in the following minimum areas:

QS 1. Leadership and responsiveness as a member of the Extended Operations Team of the CCCCO Division of Workforce and Economic Development.

QS 2. Strength of partnership with education and industry partners

QS 3. Strength of awareness and influence on state and regional policy related issues

QS 4. Strength of leadership and coordination in building of necessary supporting capacity, such as center, advisories, collaborative communities, and a hub.

Leading Indicators of Curriculum Alignment to Labor Market Needs

A number of efforts take a long time to manifest in ARCC 2.0 outcomes, therefore the use of leading indicators can serve as predictors of student progression in the interim. The following leading indicators have been identified to facilitate alignment of educational programming to labor market needs.

- Occurrences of the following:
  LI 1. Alignment of skillsets within a program (or set of courses) to a particular occupation and the needs of the labor market
  LI 2. Regionalization of stackable certificates aligned with a particular occupation ladder
  LI 3. Alignment of a certificate with state-, industry-, nationally-, and/or employer-recognized certification
  LI 4. Creation of a credit certificate from non-credit certificate
  LI 5. Curriculum articulation along a career or multi-career educational pathway
  LI 6. Updating the skills of faculty, teachers, counselors, and/or 'supporting staff to student' to reflect labor market needs
  LI 7. Integration of small business creation and/or exporting modules into for-credit curriculum in other disciplines

- During 2013-14, Regional Consortia Chairs will report progress on Leading Indicators as part of their Final Report. In subsequent years, employer-led advisory bodies will evaluate the effectiveness of these efforts, on a scale of 1-5 where:
  ✓ 5 = exceeds expectation
  ✓ 4 = meets expectation
  ✓ 3 = almost meets expectation
  ✓ 2 = below expectation
  ✓ 1 = does not meet expectation

Student Momentum Points

The data related to each momentum point will be collected automatically or if necessary, added manually to the LaunchBoard. This information will provide visibility to the influence of the grant expenditures on the success of our students. Not all momentum points must be or need to be satisfied by each grantee. Grantees should refer to their work plans to determine which momentum points they are responsible for documenting. Momentum points have been clustered according to the student's educational pathways for the reader's convenience.

Note on definitions:

CTE Pathways

- For the Common Metrics, "CTE pathways" refer to clusters of related programs.
- To view the K-12 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk—a master list of which programs are included in specific "CTE pathways," which sector they belong to, and how they are aligned between K-12, community colleges, and four-year universities—please visit http://doingwhatmatters.cccco.edu/LaunchBoard/ProgramCodeCrosswalk.aspx.
- K-12 CTE Industry Sector Codes are based on the Course Group State Codes specified in the K-12 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk.
- Community College CTE Industry Sector Codes are based on the four-digit or six-digit Taxonomy of Program (TOP) codes specified in the K-12 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk.
- Four-year University CTE Industry Sector Codes are based on the four-digit or six-digit Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) codes specified in the K-12 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk.
- If a program is assigned to an incorrect code in the K-12 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk, CTE deans should send an email to launchboard@cccco.edu to indicate their recommended designation. This recommendation will then be reviewed by the Chancellor's Office.

CTE Students

- Students are considered to be on a K-12 CTE pathway if they take one course while in high school in a pathway identified in the K-12 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk or if grantees submit information on students (such as participants in a career awareness workshop).
- Students are considered to be in a community college CTE pathway if they take one or more courses while in community college in a pathway identified in the K-12 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk or, for Momentum Point 33, if grantees submit information on individual learners (participants in incumbent worker or contract education) in a pathway identified in the K-12 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk.
- Students are considered to be in a four-year university/college CTE pathway if they declare a major while in a four-year institution in a pathway identified in the K-12 to CCC Program Code Crosswalk.
- A first-time student is a student who enrolled in a community college for the first time after high school (having not previously enrolled in a post-secondary educational institution).

The cohort of students included in the Common Metrics reflects a broad definition of CTE participation, including students who enroll in apprenticeship programs and students who engage in short-term course-taking. This is a more comprehensive definition of CTE participation than is used in California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office reports such as the CTE Scorecard and the Salary Surfer, to ensure that information is gathered on students

who do not complete programs as well as those who do, to drive program improvement. In the future, the LaunchBoard will include the ability to filter outcomes for multiple cohorts such as:

- A CTE participant cohort: students who have taken one or more apprenticeship or higher-level courses (SAM code A, B, or C) within a specific CTE program
- The CTE Scorecard cohort: students who have taken more than 8 units of higher-level courses (SAM code B or C) within a specific CTE program
- The CTE Outcomes Survey cohort: students who have taken 9 or more units, where at least one course is apprenticeship or higher-level (SAM code A, B, or C), within any CTE program
- A low-unit skills-builder cohort: students who have taken 8 or fewer units, which may be apprenticeship, higher-level, or introductory (SAM code A, B, C or D), within any CTE program
- Custom cohorts uploaded by a college

Middle School Cluster

MP 1. Completed an individual career and skills awareness workshop in middle school that included a normed assessment process and was in a Doing What MATTERS priority or emerging sector
- Data elements: Total number of students who participated in awareness workshops.
  Source: Grantee Activity Tracking

Transition from Middle School to High School

MP 2. Completed a bridge program between middle school and high school and revised student career/education plan
- Data elements: Total number of students who participated in bridge programs.
  Source: Grantee Activity Tracking

MP 3. Completed a student orientation & assessment program while in middle school or high school
- Data elements: Total number of students who completed orientation and assessment programs.
  Source: Grantee Activity Tracking

High School Cluster

MP 4. Completed one course in high school within a CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School), Term and/or Academic Year, California Basic Educational Data System Code (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
  Source: Cal-Pass Plus

MP 5. Completed two or more courses in high school within a CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School), Term and/or Academic Year, California Basic Educational Data System Code (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
  Source: Cal-Pass Plus

MP 6. Completed a CTE articulated course
- Data elements: Total number of students who completed articulated courses.
  Source: CATEMA or Campus Submitted File

MP 6A. Successfully completed a CTE dual enrollment course or credit by exam, with receipt of transcripted credits
- Data elements: Total number of students who received transcripted credits for dual enrollment courses and credit by exam.
  Source: CATEMA or Campus Submitted File

MP 7. Completed a program in high school within a CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School), Term and/or Academic Year, California Basic Educational Data System Code (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
  Source: Cal-Pass Plus

Transition from High School to College Cluster

MP 8. Completed a bridge program between high school and college in a CTE pathway
- Data elements: Total number of students who completed a bridge program.
  Source: Grantee Activity Tracking

MP 9. Completed college orientation & assessment as a first-time community college student who entered a community college CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School), Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, California Basic Educational Data System Code (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
  Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office

MP 10. Transitioned from a high school CTE pathway to a similar community college CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School), Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, California Basic Educational Data System Code (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
  Source: Cal-Pass Plus

MP 11.   Transferred from a high school CTE pathway to a similar CSU, UC or private/independent university CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School), University IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, California Basic Educational Data System Code (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Four-Year University Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) Code.
  Source: Cal-Pass Plus

MP 12.   Completed a counselor-approved college education plan, for first-time community college students who enter a CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
  Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office

MP 13.   During high school, participated in an internship, work-based learning, mentoring, or job shadowing program in a CTE pathway
- Data elements: Total number of students who participated in work-based learning activities.
  Source: Grantee Activity Tracking

MP 14.   Percentage of community college students, who participated in a high school CTE pathway, whose first math or English course was below transfer-level
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, High School CDS Code (County, District, School), Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, California Basic Educational Data System Code (CBEDS), Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Basic Skills Courses Taken.
  Source: Cal-Pass Plus

Community College Cluster

MP 15.   Completed two courses in the same CTE Pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
  Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office

MP 16.   Retention rate between Fall and Spring within a CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
  Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office

MP 17.   Completed a non-CCCCO-approved certificate within a CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender*,* Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Credit or Noncredit status.
Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office

MP 18.   Completed a CCCCO-approved certificate within a CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender*,* Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Credit or Noncredit status.
Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office

General Education and Transfer Progress Cluster

MP 19.   Completed a work readiness soft skills training program within a CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender*,* Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
Source: Campus Submitted File

MP 20.   Completed college level English and/or math, for students in a CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender*,* Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, College-Level English and Math Courses Passed, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office

MP 21.   Completed the CSU-GE or IGETC transfer track/certificate for students in a CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender*,* Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
Source: Campus Submitted file

MP 22.   Completed requirements in a CTE pathway, but did not receive a certificate or a degree
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender*,* Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
Source: Campus Submitted File

MP 23.   Completed an associate degree in a CTE major
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender*,* Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office

MP 24.   Completed an associate degree in a major different from student's college CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, College Goal, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
  Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office

MP 25.   Transferred from community college to a four-year university in the same CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, University IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Four-Year University Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) Code.
  Source: Cal-Pass Plus

MP 26.   Transferred from community college to a four-year university in a major different from their CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, University IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Four-Year University Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) Code.
  Source: Cal-Pass Plus

Community College Transition to Workforce Cluster

MP 27.   Participated in a college internship or workplace learning program within a CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
  Source: Campus Submitted File

MP 28.   Attained a job placement in the same or similar field of study as CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
  Source: CTE Employment Outcomes Survey or Campus Submitted File

MP 29.   Acquired an industry-recognized, third-party credential
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender, Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
  Source: CTE Employment Outcomes Survey or Campus Submitted File

Workforce Progress Cluster

MP 30.   Attained a wage gain in a career in the same or similar CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender*,* Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code.
  Source: CTE Employment Outcomes Survey or Campus Submitted File

MP 31.   Attained wages equal to or greater than the median entry level regional wage for that CTE pathway
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender*,* Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Wages Reported through the Unemployment Insurance Database, Wages Reported through EMSI.
  Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office

MP 32.   Attained wages greater than the regional standard-of-living wage
- Data elements: Statewide Student ID (SSID), Local Student ID, Social Security Number, Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender*,* Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, Wages Reported through the Unemployment Insurance Database, Self Sufficiency Standards Designated by the Living Insight Center for Community Economic Development.
  Source: California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office

MP 33.   Participated in incumbent worker training or contract education in a CTE pathway (for example training for layoff aversion, meeting heightened occupational credentialing requirement, transitioning employees whose occupations are being eliminated, or up-skilling existing employees)
- Data elements: Last Name, First Name, Date of Birth, Gender*,* Community College IPEDS ID, Term and/or Academic Year, Taxonomy of Program (TOP) Code, and optionally Social Security Number.
  Source: LaunchBoard Additional Tracking Tool

MP 34.   Exception

For grants providing direct services to an employer, a group of employers, or an industry sector or industry cluster (including Small Business and Global Trade), if there is no alignment with any of the Student Momentum Points and/or Leading Indicators listed above, perform an assessment of the purported 'beneficial impact' of the grant on the relevant businesses, which may include a review of the grant's purported impacts on any of the following: increased profitability, increased labor productivity, reductions in worker injuries, employer cost savings resulting from improved business processes, improved customer satisfaction, increased employee retention, increased number of employees, increased revenue projections, increased sales, penetrated new markets, as well as information on new products or services developed.

- Data elements: Determined by grantees in conjunction with their grant monitors. Momentum Point 34 outcomes will not be in the LaunchBoard.
  Source: Grantee Activity Tracking