

APPENDIX D

Common Metrics and Accountability Measures

Applicable to RFAs of the Division of Workforce and Economic Development

Background

In 2004, Assembly Bill 1417 triggered the creation of a performance measurement system for the California Community Colleges. That legislation and ensuing budget action authorized the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) to design and implement a performance measurement system containing performance indicators for the system and its colleges. This comprehensive system is known as the Accountability Reporting for the Community Colleges, or ARCC.

In 2012, the Student Success Task Force (SSTF) formed by Senate Bill 1143 recommended the implementation of a new accountability framework to provide stakeholders with clear and concise information on key student progress and success metrics in order to improve performance. The recommendation emphasized that a scorecard be built on the existing ARCC reporting system.

Following adoption of the SSTF recommendations, the ARCC (2.0) Advisory Workgroup, which guided the development of the initial accountability system in 2005, was reconvened. The workgroup had representation by individuals from various community college organizations and stakeholder groups, as well as researchers with technical expertise in performance measures. This technical workgroup reviewed the existing framework and designed the new scorecard to be released across the system in 2013.

ARCC 2.0 Framework

The ARCC Advisory Workgroup recommends a four-tiered accountability framework, where each level targets a different audience or user.

- The first level provides a report of the state of the system, a high level overview for legislators and policy makers that summarizes a number of state level aggregations of data and annual performance.
- The scorecard itself is the second level and measures progress and completion at each college for various groups of student demographics, including those with different levels of college preparation. This will be the core of the framework and part of the report that focuses on the performance of each college and incorporates many of the

recommendations from the SSTF, such as providing metrics pertaining to momentum points, the disaggregation of metrics by racial and ethnic groups and the inclusion of students taking less than 12 units.

- The third level is the ability to drill down further into the scorecard metrics through the existing online query tool, Datamart 2.0 and for CTE, the addition of the LaunchBoard.
- The fourth and most detailed level is the ability for researchers to download the datasets (Data-on-Demand) pertaining to each metric for their particular college.

The details of the above accountability framework can be viewed at the following URL:
http://extranet.cccco.edu/Portals/1/ExecutiveOffice/Board/2012_agenda/november/4_4_scorecard.pdf

Measures

The accountability for and measurement of grant activities administered through CCCC's Workforce and Economic Development Division is based on the above ARCC 2.0 framework and augments that work because scope of the Division's grants span from middle schools through community college as well as post community college and into the workforce. Three categories of measures have been included:

- *Quality of service (applies to key talent roles)*
- *Leading indicators of curriculum alignment to labor market needs*
- *Student momentum points*

Depending on the performance requirements of the funding stream from which the grant originated, certain measures within these three categories will become more relevant, but the overriding objective of moving the needle on student outcomes remains, rather than the prior practice of monitoring activities and outputs.

With this unified framework of common metrics and accountability measures, funding and program decisions can be more data-driven and evidence-based given what works in moving students towards success.

Quality of Service Measures

Certain grants are designated as 'key talents' grants for the system. Key talents facilitate and promote collaboration within a region, a sector, and/or their key constituents. These activities lead to quality of services as measured by:

QS 0. 360-degree evaluation

The tool will be provided by the CCCC. Parties surveyed will give consideration to the individual's performance in the following minimum areas:

- QS 1. Leadership and responsiveness as a member of the Extended Operations Team of the CCCCCO Division of Workforce and Economic Development.
- QS 2. Strength of partnership with education and industry partners.
- QS 3. Strength of awareness and influence on state and regional policy related issues.
- QS 4. Strength of leadership and coordination in building of necessary supporting capacity, such as center, advisories, collaborative communities, and a hub.

Leading Indicators of Curriculum Alignment to Labor Market Needs



A number of efforts take a long time to manifest in ARCC 2.0 outcomes, therefore the use of leading indicators can serve as predictors of student progression in the interim. The following leading indicators have been identified to facilitate alignment of educational programming to labor market needs.

- Occurrences of the following:
 - LI 1. Alignment of skillsets within a program (or set of courses) to a particular occupation and the needs of the labor market
 - LI 2. Regionalization of stackable certificates aligned with a particular occupation ladder
 - LI 3. Alignment of a certificate with state-, industry-, nationally-, and/or employer-recognized certification
 - LI 4. Creation of a credit certificate from non-credit certificate
 - LI 5. Curriculum articulation along a career or multi-career educational pathway
 - LI 6. Updating the skills of faculty, teachers, counselors, and/or ‘supporting staff to student’ to reflect labor market needs
 - LI 7. Integration of small business creation and/or exporting modules into for-credit curriculum in other disciplines
- For each, grantees shall provide evidence in the form of a rating by the employer-led advisory body, on a scale of 0-5.
 - ✓ 5 = exceeds expectation
 - ✓ 4 = meets expectation
 - ✓ 3 = almost meets expectation
 - ✓ 2 = below expectation
 - ✓ 1 = does not meet expectation

Student Momentum Points

The data related to each momentum point will be collected automatically or if necessary, added manually to the LaunchBoard. The combined data from the DataMart and the LaunchBoard will provide visibility to the influence of the grant expenditures on the success of our students. Not all momentum points must be or need to be satisfied by each grantee. Momentum points have been clustered according to the student's educational pathways for the reader's convenience.

NOTE: Program Codes should be in 4-digit TOP code format.

Middle School Cluster



- MP 1. Completed an individual career and skills awareness workshop that included overall industry sectors and priority/emerging sector occupations, and included a normed assessment process.
- Collect student identifier, first and last name, address, middle school name, and CDS code (County, District, School) for students participating in an awareness activity. [Note: the LaunchBoard metrics may include Academic proficiency on the CST(English Language Arts, Math and Science, and disaggregate by subgroups) for middle school students to the metrics.]

Transition from Middle School to High School



- MP 2. Completed a CTE bridge program and revised Student Career/Education Plan – CTE Pathway
- Collect student identifier, Name, Middle School & High School, CTE Goal, Region
- MP 3. Completed a student orientation & assessment program (CTE track)
- Middle school student identifier, Name, High School, CTE Goal, Region

High School Cluster



Note: The metrics to track the following activities could contain academic proficiency of students (CST scores for English Language Arts, Math and Science, disaggregated by subgroups, for high school students in any of the categories in 3-6), academic preparedness for college of students in a CTE program (EAP scores for English Language Arts and Math, disaggregated by subgroups, for high school students in any of the categories in 3-6), and Rigorous course taking (last course taken in English Language Arts, Math and Science, disaggregated by subgroups, for high school students in any of the categories in 3-6).

- MP 4. Completed one course in a selected CTE pathway in high school
- Collect student identifier, name, address, CDS code (County, District, School), pathway name, course title, sector, region

- MP 5. Completed two or more courses in a selected CTE pathway in high school
- Collect student identifier, name, address, CDS code, pathway name, sector, region , identify if the CTE courses were A-G approved
- MP 6. Completed a course in a CTE articulated pathway
- Collect student identifier, name, address, CDS code, pathway name, course title, sector, region
- MP 7. Completed an entire CTE pathway in high school
- Collect student identifier, name, address, CDS code, pathway name, sector, region

Transition from High School to College Cluster



- MP 8. Completed a CTE bridge program
- Collect student identifier, Name, CDS code, CTE Goal, Community College Name, Region
- MP 9. Completed a student orientation & assessment program (CTE track)
- Collect student identifier, Name, CDS code, CTE Goal, Community College Name, Region
- MP 10. Transitioned from a high school CTE career pathway to a community college (Primary goal)
- Along a similar major
 - To a similar CTE certificate program
 - To a CTE certificate program with articulated courses to the high school program
 - Collect student identifier, Name, CDS code, CTE Program (TOP Code), Sector, Community College Name, Region
- MP 11. Transferred from a high school CTE career pathway to a CSU, UC or Private/Independent University
- Along a similar major to CTE program
 - Collect student identifier, Name, High School and CDS code, Major, University Name, Region
- MP 12. Completed a counselor approved college Student Education Plan - CTE Pathway
- Collect student identifier, CTE Program (TOP Code), Major, Sector, Community College Name, Region, Ed plan duration

- MP 13. Participated in an internship, Work-based Learning, mentoring, or job shadowing program in the same occupational area as the CTE courses attended
- Collect student identifier, CTE Program (TOP Code), Certificate title and/or number of units completed in the program, Sector, Community College Name, Region, Name of company where internship took place. If this activity occurred while student was still in high school, then collect: Collect student identifier, Name, CDS code, Name of company where internship took place, Region
- MP 14. Increased percent of CTE students coming from a transition high school that are placed into college level (non-remedial) English and Math courses
- Match student identifier with collected SSN at the community college, collect placement status/course data, Community College Name, Region

Community College Cluster

- MP 15. Completed two courses (8 units or less) in the same 4-digit TOP code  
- Collect student SSN, CTE Program (TOP Code), Sector, Community College Name, Region, Ed plan duration, Previous educational level (A.A., B.S., etc.)
- MP 16. Term-to-term retention rates improved  
- Collect student SSN, CTE Program (TOP Code), Sector, Community College Name, Region, Ed plan duration, Previous educational level (A.A., B.S., etc.)
- MP 17. Completed a non-CCCCO-approved certificate – credit-based  
- Collect student SSN, CTE Program (TOP Code), Certificate title, Sector, Community College Name, Region, Previous educational level (A.A., B.S., etc.)
- MP 18. Completed a CCCC Approved Certificate of Achievement (Primary Goal)  
- Collect student SSN, Previous educational level (A.A., B.S., etc.)

General Education and Transfer Progress Cluster

- MP 19. Completed a work readiness Soft Skills training program (either stand-alone or embedded)  
- Collect SSN, Name, CTE program, sector, college, region
- MP 20. Completed College Level English and/or Math  
- Collect SSN, Name, CTE program, sector, college, region
- MP 21. Completed the CSU-GE or IGETC transfer track/certificate (Primary Goal)  
- Collect SSN, Name, CTE program, sector, college, region
- MP 22. Completed Major requirements in a CTE area (Primary Goal)  
- Collect SSN, Name, CTE program, major title, sector, college, region

- MP 23. Completed an A.A. Degree in a major aligned with student's CTE pathway (Primary Goal)  
- Collect SSN, Name, CTE program, major title, sector, college, region
- MP 24. Completed an A.A. Degree with a major different from student's CTE pathway.  
- Collect SSN, Name, CTE program, major title, sector, college, region
- MP 25. Transferred to a 4-year university in the same or similar CTE pathway (Primary Goal)  
- Collect SSN, Name, CTE program, major title, sector, college, region, university, university major
- MP 26. Transferred to a 4-year university with a major different from the student's CTE pathway  
- Collect SSN, Name, CTE program, major title, sector, college, region, university, university major

Community College Transition to Workforce Cluster

- MP 27. Participated in an internship or workplace learning program in the same occupational area as the educational pathway 
- Collect student SSN, CTE Program (TOP Code), Certificate title and/or number of units completed in the program, Sector, Community College Name, Region, Name of company and lead contact information where internship took place.
- MP 28. Job placement in the same or similar field of study as educational pathway 
- Collect student SSN, CTE Program (TOP Code), Certificate title and/or number of units completed in the program, Sector, Community College Name, Region, Name of company and lead contact information where internship took place.
- MP 29. Certificate acquisition (Primary Goal) 
- a. Industry recognized 3rd party credential
 - b. Short-term non-credit certificate
- For 29.a and 29.b, collect student SSN, CTE Program (TOP Code), Certificate title and/or number of units completed in the program, Sector, Community College Name, Region, Name of company and lead contact information.

Workforce Progress Cluster

- MP 30. Wage gain in a career the same or similar to CTE educational pathway (Primary Goal) 
- Leverage the LaunchBoard to track wage gains for target students (SSN, Name, Address)

- MP 31. Wage gain to standard-of-living wage band (locally determined) (Primary Goal) 
- Leverage the LaunchBoard to track wage gains for target students (SSN, Name, Address)

- MP 32. Wage gain above standard-of-living wage band (Primary Goal) 
- Leverage the LaunchBoard to track wage gains for target students (SSN, Name, Address)

- MP 33. Layoff aversion, meeting heightened occupational credentialing requirement, transitioning employees whose occupations are being eliminated, or up-skilling existing employees 
- Collect SSN, Name, Address
 - Collect Certificate from employer identifying employees as at-risk and the training program being recognized as critical training for retention.

- MP 34. Exception 

For grants providing direct services to an employer, a group of employers, or an industry sector or industry cluster (including Small Business and Global Trade), if there is no alignment with any of the Student Momentum Points and/or Leading Indicators listed above, perform an assessment of the purported ‘beneficial impact’ of the grant on the relevant businesses, which may include a review of the grant’s purported impacts on any of the following: increased profitability, increased labor productivity, reductions in worker injuries, employer cost savings resulting from improved business processes, improved customer satisfaction, increased employee retention, increased number of employees, increased revenue projections, increased sales, penetrated new markets, as well as information on new products or services developed.

NOTE: Projects that do NOT move Student Momentum Points or Leading Indicators must be pre-approved by the employer advisory body or the regional consortia. In time-sensitive situations, approval may be requested directly from the CCCC.

- Include the ‘business beneficial impact’ fields, including program, Sector, Region, Name of company, lead contact information of company sponsoring the project, and details on activities and outcomes of project. Furthermore collect a verification letter from employer attesting to the ‘beneficial impact’ thereof.